

KONTROVERSI QISHOSUL QUR'AN : STUDI KOMPARATIF PEMIKIRAN ORIENTALIS DAN PEMIKIRAN OKSIDENTALIS (THEODOR NOLDEKE DAN HASAN HANAFI)

Bobby Rachman Santoso

UIN Sayyid Ali Rahmatullah Tulungagung, Indonesia

imam_mutaqien2024@gmail.com

Abstract

The orientalist group has become a controversial topic and contradicts the thinking of Muslims, as was done by Theodor Noldeke with his thoughts that invited controversy by doubting the Qur'an as our holy Muslims, considering that the prophet Muhammad Saw. was a liar, even orientalist thought has become a scientific study that is still being studied by many academic actors. However, Muslim scientists are not just silent seeing the Western movement in this case represented by orientalists who criticize the Qur'an, as an effort to balance the thoughts of orientalism aroused Muslim thinkers to respond to the Western world criticizing the Eastern world, especially those aimed at Muslims, behind the birth of the thought of occidentalism as a resistance to face orientalism, so that Islam is not increasingly pushed aside by the deviant thoughts of orientalism. Thus, there is a need for Muslim movements in defending the truth of Islam, as has been done by Islamic thinkers, including one of the figures of occidentalism.

Keywords: *Orientalist, Occidentalism, Al-Qur'ān.*

Abstrak

Kelompok orientalist telah menjadi topik kontroversial dan berlawanan dengan pemikiran umat Islam, seperti halnya yang dilakukan oleh Theodor Noldeke dengan pemikiran-pemikirannya yang mengundang kontroversi dengan sikap meragukan al-Qur'an sebagai kitab suci umat Islam, menganggap bahwa nabi Muhammad Saw. adalah seorang pembohong, bahkan pemikiran orientalist telah menjadi kajian ilmiah yang hingga saat ini masih dikaji oleh banyak pelaku akademisi. Meski demikian ilmuwan Muslim tidak hanya diam melihat gerakan Barat dalam hal ini diwakili oleh orientalist yang melakukan kritik terhadap al-Qur'an, sebagai upaya untuk menyeimbangi pemikiran-pemikiran orientalisme menggugah pemikir Muslim untuk memberikan respon terhadap dunia Barat yang mengkritik dunia Timur khususnya yang ditujukan kepada umat Islam, melatarbelakangi lahirnya pemikiran oksidentalisme sebagai perlawanan untuk menghadapi orientalisme, agar Islam tidak semakin tersingkirkan dengan pemikiran-pemikiran menyimpang orientalisme. Dengan demikian diperlukan gerakan-gerakan umat Islam dalam membela kebenaran Islam, seperti yang telah dilakukan oleh tokoh-tokoh pemikir Islam, termasuk salah satunya tokoh oksidentalisme.

Kata kunci: *Orientalist, Oksidentalism, Al-Qur'an*

Introduction

The Qur'an has an important role for Muslims, namely as a source of reference and guidelines for the sustainability of Islamic civilization.¹ The Qur'an is *kalamullah* which became a revelation for the Prophet Muhammad (saw), as a complement to the previous teachings that were gradually passed down over 23 years and revealed to provide a response to the problems of Arab life at that time.² not only does it take a long time, the process of the transmission of the Qur'an is not only conveyed so easily, but the Prophet Muhammad (saw) has gone through a process that is not easy, even in some of the revelations that came down from the Prophet Muhammad (saw). Feel difficulty when receiving revelation.

There are several opinions related to the process of conveying revelation to the Prophet Muhammad (saw), one of which states that there are two types of methods in conveying revelation, *First*, The angel Gabriel did not appear in his form directly but through a loud thump sound so that made the Prophet Muhammad (saw) aware of the existence of the angel Gabriel at that time. *Second*, disguise the angel Gabriel into a male figure and through this method the Prophet Muhammad (saw) made it easier to receive revelation.³ However, the process that the Prophet Muhammad (saw) went through in receiving revelation did not reduce the patience of the Prophet Muhammad (saw) as the choice of Allah swt. to convey goodness on earth.

As the holy book of Islam, the Qur'an attracted a lot of attention from various circles to the point that many Qur'an scholars emerged, one of which was from contemporary thinkers such as Ashgar Ali Engineer, Fazlur Rahman, Quraish Shibah, not only that, Western thinkers also participated in giving their thoughts on the Qur'an such as Andrew Rippin, Richard Martin, Arthur John Arberry and others.⁴ The interesting fact is that the Qur'an is not

¹Abdurrahman Hakim, "Tafsir Al-Qur'an Dengan Al-Qur'an: Studi Analisis-Kritis dalam Lintas Sejarah," Misykat 2, no. 1 (2017). Tidak hanya itu, Al-Qur'an juga menjadi sumber intelektual dan spiritual bagi Muslim, kehadirannya membawa evolusi dalam pembentukan sains Islam. Lihat: Zetty Nurzuliana Rashed, dkk, "Peranan AlQuran Sebagai Sumber Ilmu Pengetahuan Dan Hubungannya Dengan Sains," *Proceeding of 5th International Conference on Islamic Education* 2016 (ICIED 2016), Institut Pendidikan Guru Kampus Tun Abdul Razak, Kota Samarahan, Sarawak.

² Irma Riyani, "Menelusuri Latar Historis Turunnya al-Quran dan Proses Pembentukan Tatanan Masyarakat," Al-Bayan: Jurnal Studi Al-Qur'an dan Tafsir 1, no. 1 (2016). Turunnya Al-Qur'an berfungsi untuk meluruskan patologi sosial bangsa Arab juga sebagai kitab petunjuk bagi seluruh manusia. Tata nilai kehidupan yang dibawa alQur'an selanjutnya mampu mengubah tatanan kehidupan bangsa Arab yang saat itu dalam kondisi sangat parah.

³ Muhammad Yoga Firdaus, "Diskursus Al-Qur'an dan Prosesi Pewahyuan dalam jurnal *Madani* : Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Keislaman 12, No. 1 2022,3.

⁴ Nur Fuadi Rahman, "Hermeneutika Al-Qur'an," Jurnal Transformatif (Islamic Studies) 1, no. 2 (2017). Terdapat beberapa alasan mengapa pendekatan hermeneutika tidak tepat untuk mengkaji al-Qur'an, *Pertama*, ahli hermeneutika menganggap bahwa al-Qur'an adalah hasil budaya dengan demikian kedudukan al-Qur'an akan menimbulkan keraguan akan kebenaran al-Qur'an, *kedua*, dalam sejarahnya hermeneutika digunakan dalam mengkaji Bible sehingga tidak tepat jika diterapkan pula dalam mengkaji al-Qur'an, meski

only studied by thinkers from Islam but there are thinkers from non-Muslims who of course the results of their studies must first be adjusted to the standardization in studying the Qur'an.

As human civilization progresses, discourses related to the Qur'an move dynamically continue to emerge. Such as the interpretation of Qur'anic verses, the study of the language of the Qur'an, to criticism and the inherent methodology in studying the Qur'an. In the Western world, the Qur'an has been studied and used as the main source as a reference in understanding the teachings of Islam⁵ This is good news for Muslims, but apart from this, it does not close the desire of Western scientists to study the Qur'an in order to find the weaknesses of Islam, as well as to criticize the authenticity of the Qur'an as the holy book of Muslims. This is as done by a group of Western scientists who in this article are called the *orientalist*.

The existence of a study of the Qur'an carried out by the group *orientalist* gives rise to many misconceptions in the West regarding the teachings in Islam. Even the worst impact is that there are Western Muslim groups who believe in the results of the group study *orientalist*. Seeing this, it gives the spirit for Muslim scholars to study and defend the truth of the Qur'an in front of all mankind. Seeing this phenomenon raises a problem formulation for the author, namely how *Qashah Al-Qur'an* according to orientalist? How to *Qashah Al-Qur'an* According to the Oxidalists? And how does it compare *Qashah Al-Qur'an* according to both?

Method

In this study, a type of qualitative research was used with an approach *library research* to examine more deeply related to the research topic. The data in this study was obtained from previous literature such as books, journal articles, and research results. which has the same topic, namely related to orientalist and occidentalist. This research aims to provide new insights related to orientalist and occidentalist to be able to contribute to the development of the scientific field of Islamic studies.

demikian terdapat kelompok yang setuju dengan hermeneutika dijadikan pendekatan dalam mengkaji al-Qur'an. Hermeneutika sendiri adalah disiplin ilmu yang ada kaitanya dengan interpretasi teks dan makna yang ada didalamnya. Dalam memahami Al-Qur'an, terdapat beberapa pendekatan hermeneutika yang digunakan. Arip Purkon, "Pendekatan Hermeneutika Dalam Kajian Hukum Islam," Ahkam 13, no. 2 (2013): 186–87. Juga: Muhammad Iqbal Suma, "Hermeneutika Al-Qur'an", link: <https://www.qureta.com/post/hermeneutika-alqur%E2%80%99>

⁵ This opinion is evidenced by the small number of non-Muslim Quran scholars, such as; Arthur John Arberry, Richard Martin, John Wansbrough, Andrew Rippin, Jane Dammen McAuliffe, Gabriel Said Reynolds, and Angelika Neuwirth whose work on the study of the Qur'an was widely published through international scientific journals, books, which were then often discussed in various activities such as seminars. See Abdullah Saeed, *The Quran: An Introduction*, London and New York: Routledge, 2008. pp. 99-113.

SABILUNA: Journal of Islamic Studies E-ISSN: 3109-6581

Concept Orientalist and *Oksidentalits*

Religion occupies a central position for humanity. So that religion has a great influence in shaping the mindset, and inspiring for humans in carrying out their daily lives. There are groups of *Abrahamic religions* that have many followers, namely Judaism, Christianity, and Islam.⁶ In essence, the three great religions were revealed to have the goal of human welfare and peace.

In the history that has been running, the three major religions have walked their respective paths and even built relationships and contact relationships between the three so as to give birth to various positive things that build the civilization of the three religions, but it is undeniable that negative things are also present because of course from the three major religions there are differences both in terms of religious norms, as well as the perception of the followers of each religion. Starting from the similarities, sympathizers to the contradiction can be seen through religious studies. One of the groups that criticizes the Qur'an is an *orientalist* group with its idea of orientalism.

Orientalism has stolen the attention of various circles of society so that there have been many studies that have explored orientalism, it does not only apply to Islamic institutions, but also to Western universities. Because in essence, the study of *orientalism* involves the West which is mostly non-Muslim and makes the East the birthplace of Islam, namely Arabia as the object of study. Orientalists etymologically derive from the word "orient" which means east and if in Latin "oriens" means "arise", then there is an appendix "is" or "ism" which contains the meaning of a doctrine.⁷ In general, an orientalist can be defined as an expert or someone who delves into the lives of people from Eastern regions such as Asia, the Middle East and other surrounding areas both from the language, culture, and civilization of Eastern nations. Meanwhile, in terminology, orientalist is defined as someone who delves into the study of the eastern world, especially language, religion, history, culture, literature and civilization.

Edward Said explained that orientalism is a social and intellectual construct used by the West to define, control and position the East as exotic, primitive, and inferior to the West

⁶ Baca James Kritzeck, *Sons of Abraham : Jews, Christianity and Moslems* (Baltimore : Gelicon Press, 1962); F.E. Peters, *Children of Abraham : Judaism, Christianity, Islam* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1984)

⁷ Sholihah, Hadith Study from an Orientalist Perspective in the journal *Samasyat: Journal of Islamic and Social Studies* Vol. 6 No. 1 2022, pp. 20-21.

which is considered superior. According to Edward Said, orientalism was used as a tool of legitimacy in the political realm and the colonization of the East carried out by the West. In the field of Islamic Studies, orientalism is defined as Western scientists who study Islam from various aspects, although it is often criticized because it is considered subjective and biased in its various studies.⁸

Orientalism by Edward W. Said is defined as a tradition that studies the East and Islam that is studied by the West and has lasted for centuries until the study is categorized as a scientific study. However, because the object of this study is generally the Western population, ideological, religious, and cultural tendencies of the West are inevitable⁹ which results in the existence of a *framework* in studying the East and Islam.

Edward W. Said through his book entitled *Orientalism* explained that orientalism is a field of oriental studies that originated from the presence of the British and French who had established relations with the Orientals in the early nineteenth century and at that time only India and the evangelical lands and at the end of World War II Britain and France ruled over the Eastern world and orientalism. After World War II ended, the Eastern world was taken over by the United States using the approach that had been done by Britain and France. Through this approach, orientalist texts emerged.¹⁰

According to Edward W. Said, which was expressed in his two books entitled *The World, The Next and The Critic* and the book *Orientalism*, it is believed that *orientalists* and the West are forms of discrimination. Orientalist groups are known for their criticism of a specific study but when they study one field they will miss other fields, for example, *orientalist* groups that criticize fiqh experts but do not associate them with Kalam, criticism of the Qur'an but not followed by the science of interpretation, criticism of philosophy but not associated with the study of aqidah. In fact, it is common for *orientalists* to study the Qur'an using the methodology of the Bible,¹¹ understand Islamic politics from a secular Western perspective, and all scientific fields in Islam are studied through a Western perspective without using the *framework* of Islamic studies.

There are Some of the characters *orientalist* who has spent his entire life studying the Qur'an from its various aspects, for example Theodore Noldeke and Abraham Geiger studying

⁸ Edward W. Said, *Orientalism*, (New York:Pantheon Books,1979).

⁹ Edward W. Said, *Orientalism*, (Yogyakarta: Pustaka Siswa, 2016),204.

¹⁰ *Ibid*, 5.

¹¹ The Biblical methodology in Qur'an Studies is interpreted as answers to criticisms of the Qur'an delivered by orientalist groups . This really needs a deeper explanation so as not to cause misunderstandings regarding the truth of the Qur'an and the prophet Muhammad (saw).

the history of the Qur'anic texts,¹² Richard Bell and M.Watt who studied the theory of revision of the Qur'anic text,¹³ J.A Bellamy with his assumption was related to mistakes in the writing of the Qur'an. Other figures such as Prerzl Tisdal, Wansbrough, Bergtrasser, Mingana and so on gave birth to works *orientalist* such as *Leaves Form Three Ancient Qurans, Possibly Pre-'Othemanic With a List Oftheir Variants* published in Cambridge in 1914.

If *orientalists* are a group that criticizes Islam and makes Islam an object of study, then the opponent of *orientalists* is an *oxidental* who makes the West a study, in this case of a Muslim group. However, more than that, *the Occidentalists* according to Hassan Hanafi were created to be a medium for Muslims in facing the West which can influence Eastern civilization which in this case is specifically for Muslims. The existence of *Occidentalalites* aims to dispel the myth that the West is a representation of the world.¹⁴

Occidentalism is all things related to the West or *Occident/Western*, be it in the form of culture, nation, population, way of thinking, ethics, viewpoint and so on, while *occidentalism* is interpreted as culture, disposition, customs and others that come from the West.¹⁵ Westernism by Mukti Ali is defined as "the theories and sciences of Western religion, culture, and civilization" religions in this definition are Catholic Christianity, Protestant Christianity, and Judaism.¹⁶

Meanwhile, according to Prof. Burhanuddin Daisy, westernism is defined as a school or an understanding that is within the scope of academic studies and also knowledge about the Western world carried out by Eastern groups with an Eastern point of view as well.¹⁷ Hasan Hanafi considers that westernism is the opposite of orientalism where westernism moves to study the West to study the development both in terms of culture, structure and tradition and aims to abolish Western domination in the East.¹⁸

The term Westernism was popularized by Dr. Hasan Hanafi who is a thinker from Egypt, Westernism is a study that makes the West an object of study that examines everything that exists in the West both from its life and culture. The purpose of Westernism is to break the Western perception that the East is "*The Observe*".¹⁹ The idea of westernism came after

¹² Arthur Jeffery, "*Progress in the Study of the Qur'an Text*", (tt. Muslim World, 1935), 4-16

¹³ Richard Bell & W.M.Watt, Introduction to the Qur'an, (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1970)

¹⁴ Hassan Hanafi, *Westernism*, (Jakarta: Paramadina, 2000), 23

¹⁵ Prof. Burhanuddin Daya, *The Struggle of the East Responding to the West: The Basics of Westernism*, (t.t:Suka Press:2008),88-89.

¹⁶ *Ibid*, 96.

¹⁷ *Ibid*, 100.

¹⁸ Abad Badruzzaman, *Left Islam Hasan Hanafi: Suing the Establishment of Religion and Politics*, (Yogyakarta: Tiara Wacana:2005),53.

¹⁹ Hasan Hanafi, *Muqaddimah fi 'ilm al-istighrah*, (Cairo: Al Dar al Faniyah, Cet. 1), 9-50.

the realization that the West (orientalists) had taken advantage of the progress of Islam in the name of the discovery of Islam as belonging to the West.

Westernism itself is not a new discourse because the relationship between East and West has been going on since the presence of *the ego* that represents the teachings of Islam for approximately fourteen centuries. If traced to the roots of *the occidentalist*, there is a reason for the relationship between the East and Greece which is included in the Western part both in terms of its history, geography and civilization. Westernism is not only the opposite of orientalism or reverse orientalism but at the same time it is a response to *westernization* and an attempt to save the East from Western influence.²⁰ Westernism basically provides a discourse to respond to Western civilization not to reject or accept but to invite to foster a sense of criticism of Western civilization.²¹

Hasan Hanafi through the idea of westernism wants to be able to eliminate domination over each other, realizing that between humans are equal, both individuals and groups of nations. The emergence of westernism initially surprised the West who were complacent with modernization born through technology and science, which then came westernism as a signal for the west to deconstruct modernization. In this case, Westernism informs Islam that there is a problem that must be fought, namely Western hegemony and fostering the habit of critical thinking towards an even more advanced Muslim body.

Qishoshul Qur'an Orientalist Perspective

Groups *orientalist* has tried various things to criticize, and attack the Qur'an from various aspects to be able to provide propositional and negative facts. These efforts are carried out by systematically and intensively studying the Qur'an in order to foster confidence in the results of the study conducted by the group *orientalist* that the Qur'an that is currently circulating is not authentic.

There are three assumptions *orientalist* to the authenticity of the Qur'an, namely: *First*, Group *orientalist* considers that the Qur'an is a written text or document, as well as the sequence of the process of the Qur'an being revealed, its delivery, until the teaching of the Qur'an is carried out in writing rather than a reading or memorization that is read.²²

²⁰ *Ibid*, 66.

²¹ Wilda Rihlasyita, Hasan Hanafi Islamic Left and Westernism in *Al Yasini Journal* Vol. 04, Number 02, November 2019, 112.

²² The Qur'an is essentially a reading (*qira'ah*) and not a writing (*rasm*), meaning that all processes from the descent of the Qur'an to its distribution to mankind through memorization and orally are not writing. The *orientalist* opinion as above is a mistake that becomes a *boomerang* for their group, as done by Jeffery, Puin, and Wansbrough who consider that the Qur'an is a written text and that every process of its descent is not done

Tholder Noldeke is one of the *orientalist* which originated in Germany. He studied Islam from various aspects such as Islamic history, the Arabic language, and the Qur'an as the holy book of Muslims. Tholder Noldeke was born on March 2, 1836 in Hamburg and a professor of languages at Strasbourg University from 1872 to 1906. Noldeke was the son of a priest and also a teacher who had the status of a German civil servant. At the beginning of his education, his father taught classical literature from Greek and Latin, and then Noeldeke continued his education at the University of Göttingen, where Noeldoke studied three languages, namely Arabic, Hebrew, and Syriac with his teacher Heinrich Elwald who graduated from Hebrew²³

Noeldeke had earned a doctorate in 1856 with the title of his dissertation "*Tarikh Al-Qur'an*", completed at the age of 20, in 1857 to 1858 Noldeke conducted research in Leiden, where Noldeke met several *orientalist* thinkers such as Dozy, Mattys de Vries, Kuenan, and Juynboll from that meeting Noldeke became friends to explore Arabic manuscripts. In the same year Noldeke became friends with young *orientalist* figures namely de Coeje, de Jong, and Engelman.

On April 26, 1858 Noldeke and R. Gosche went to Berlin to conduct research on Arabic manuscripts. R. Gosche was an *orientalist* from Germany and the first author to compile an index of the writings of Imam Al-Ghozali. Noldeke and R. Gosche lived in Berlin for approximately two years until September 2, 1860.²⁴ After returning from Berlin, Noldeke traveled to Rome, Italy and stayed there for three months, what became unique about Noldeke's travels was that he had never visited Arabia which incidentally was the country of Islam's arrival even though Noldeke had studied a lot of studies about Arabic both from language, history, geography and so on.

by memorization, orally or read, even though the text of the Qur'an as it exists today is only for support, and the process of lowering the Qur'an through orally, memorization, and reading have been proven to maintain the authenticity of the Qur'an to the present day and there has been no change in the text from the beginning to the present as happened with the Bible, therefore *orientalists* want the Qur'an to be studied in order to find similarities with the Bible, in essence they are jealous of the authenticity of the Qur'an. See William Montgomery, Bells Introduction to the Qur'an, translated by Sudana under the title *Richard Bells Introduction to the Qur'an*, (Jakarta, IInis, 1998),99.

²³ Hayat Hidayat and Mohammad Hidayat, *The History of the Qur'an in the View of Theodor Noldeke (1836-1930)* in "*Orientalist Studies on the Qur'an and Hadith*" Editor M. Anwar Syarifuddin, (Jakarta: UIN Sayirf Hidayatullah, 2012),39. Noldeke won the *Academie des Inscription et Belles-Lettes* in France in 1858 for his work on the history of the Qur'an. After completing the activity, Noeldeke's work was corrected and translated into German entitled *Geschichte des Qorans*. Through the book, Noldeke's name began to be known as a famous orientalist figure. Kurid Fadal, Orientalist View of the Qur'an: Theodor Noldeke's Theory of the Influence of the Qur'an in the *Journal of Religion: Department of Ushuludin* STAIN Pekalongan, Vol, 14, No, October 2, 2011, 192.

²⁴ Abdurrahman Badawi, *Encyclopedia of Orientalist Figures*, (Yogyakarta: LKiS, 2003), 24.

SABILUNA: Journal of Islamic Studies E-ISSN: 3109-6581

Noldeke along with his two themes, Sprenger and Mitchell Amari, submitted the results of a study that discussed the history of the Qur'an, until they received 1,333 French francs. Followed by two years later, Noldeke, along with Schwally, published the results of his research in two languages, namely German and Latin, under the title *Geschichte des Qorans*.

Until Noldeke was appointed Professor of Semitic languages in 1864. And in 1872 Noldeke was appointed Professor at the University of Strassburg.²⁵ Noldeke had a major role among other German *orientalists*, he poured all his intellectual abilities into the study of Islam or the East. At the end of his life, after quitting his profession as a lecturer, Noldeke chose to live with his son and daughter in the city of Karlsruhe, until he died on December 25, 1930.

Hassan Hanafi as Oxysidentalis

Hasan Hanafi is a liberal rational intellectual who was born on February 14, 1934. Hasan Hanafi was born into a family of Bani Suwayf in Cairo, Egypt, a Hanafi grew up in the Cairo Fathimi neighborhood of the area close to Fort Salahuddin in the village of Al-Azhar.²⁶ Hasan Hanafi is known as a thinker in the field of Islamic law as well as a professor of philosophy at Cairo University, Egypt.²⁷ Since the age of five he has been studying the Qur'an with his teacher Shaykh Sayyid.

Hasan Hanafi once lived in a bunker as a safe place during World War II between Britain and Germany. Hanafi was amazed by the German history with the German spirit and idealism in defending Egypt from the British, so Hanafi often attended German studies and courses. According to Hanafi, there are similarities between Arabs and Germans, namely in broadcasting naturalism, ratio, strength, and idealism.²⁸

From 1952 to 1956 Hanafi continued his education at Cairo University to study philosophy, followed in 1956-1966 Hanafi studied at the Sorbonne University in France, where Hanafi studied the methodology of thought, renewal and the history of philosophy with a Catholic, Jean Gitton, not only that Hanafi also studied phenomenology with Paul Ricouer,

²⁵ *Ibid*, 23.

²⁶ Hasan Hanafi, *From Faith to the Revolution of Our Attitude Towards Old Traditions*, (Jakarta: Paramadina, 2003), 1.

²⁷ Hasan Hanafi, *Westernism Our Attitude to Western Traditions*, (Jakarta: Paramadina, 2000), 69.

²⁸ Hasan Hanafi, *The Relevance of The Islamic Alternative in Egypt* (Arab Study Quarterly, 1982)

studied the analysis of consciousness with Husserl, and provide guidance for renewal writing *Ushul Fiqh* with Professor Masnion.²⁹

Hasan Hanafi has a very extraordinary career in the academic field, he not only received one Professorship, apart from the Sorbonne University of France, Hanafi received a Professor (*Visiting Professor*) in Belgium, the United States, Morocco, Japan, and Kuwait, as well as from the United Arab Emirates as a teaching advisor at the United Nations University of Tokyo Japan, Hanafi is highly prominent as an Islamic thinker.³⁰ One of the figures who influenced Hasan Hanafi was Sayyid Qutb, he even once said:

"If Sayyid Qutb was still alive at that time, I would have been his best student, and if the da'wah of the Muslim community continued, I would have been his thinker and draftsman."

Orientalist and Orientalist Study of *Qishohul Qur'an*

Orientalism can be referred to as the activity of exploring Islamic scientific texts such as the Qur'an by collecting and translating those that were originally in Arabic and then translated into Latin by Westerners and have been going on since the Middle Ages. The *orientalist* group aims to build new ideas as an effort to seize the Eastern world (Islam) such as its ideology, culture, and history which is considered to be opposite to the West.³¹

The Qur'an has attracted the attention of orientalist thinkers and has been studied from various groups, which makes it difficult for Muslim intellectuals to respond to arguments or ideas directed at the Qur'an, such as the criticism of Theodor Noldeke who is a famous figure for the *orientalist* group.

Noeldeke views the Qur'an as a holy book as well as a guideline for Muslims, and Muslims believe in the originality and truth of what is in the Qur'an as well as a unifier of the ummah consisting of various different madzah, but Noeldeke believes that the Qur'an is a

²⁹ John I. Esposito, *The Oxford Encyclopedea of The Modern Islamic Word*, (New York : Oxford University Press,1995),63.

³⁰ Hasan Hanafi, *From Faith to Revolution...*, *Ibid*, 70.

³¹ Orientalism has an opposite, namely westernism which is defined as various things related to the West, both from ideological, historical, and cultural aspects. The famous figure of Westernism is Hasan Hanafi who is a figure from Egypt as well as the owner of the mega project *al-Turats Wa al-Tajdid* (Tradition and renewal) and Westernism is one part of the mega project. The birth of Westernism thought as an answer to *eurocentrism* and orientalist perceptions of the Eastern world resulted in a lame view of world representation. See Hasan Hanafi, *Westernism: Our Attitude to Western Traditions*, Translated by M. Najib Buchori from the original title "*al-Muqaddimah fi 'ilm al Istigrah*" Jakarta: paramadina, 2000, 13-16.

duplicate of the previous books after analyzing with a semantic approach of the Qur'an with the previous books.³²

The Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) was considered a liar (*In the Paster*), not the prophet, and the one who composed (*Bad Out*) fill in the Qur'an with the team that follows it. Noldeke's thinking is based on the thought of Abraham Geiger who has several views on Islam that are considered influenced by Judaism, *First*, related to doctrine and faith, *Second*, legal and moral norms, *third*, related to the perspective of life.³³

There are three methodologies applied by *orientalist* groups in exploring Eastern studies, *first*, the approach of historical criticism, *second*, the inter-textual approach, and *third*, the physiological approach. The physiological approach used by the *orientalist* group has several phases, namely research and criticism of manuscript values, the form of written works, and tracing the source of the work.³⁴

Orientalist groups do not only criticize the originality of the Qur'an, but more than that, *orientalist* raises the classic issue related to the influence of Jews, Christians, and Zoroastrians on the content of the Qur'an. Groups *orientalist* did not want to admit that the prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) was the messenger of Allah (SWT) and the Qur'an was revealed to the prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) as a miracle. Groups *orientalist* Considering that the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) was rash during the revelation, they even considered that the Prophet Muhammad had a history of epilepsy (ayan), the Qur'an was the result of the reflections of the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him), and the worst was to think that the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) had a mental illness.³⁵

Noldeke as one of the famous figures *orientalist* considers that the Torah and the Gospel are the source of reference for the compilation of the Qur'an. This is because Noldeke considers that the stories, laws, eschatological in the Qur'an have similarities with the two books, and even what is in the Qur'an is considered a concept that exists and is used in the Jewish book. Therefore, Noldeke uses a physiological approach to compare the texts in the Qur'an with the previous book, the book of Judaism.

Geiger has the assumption that, through the history that has been running, the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) is considered a figure who plays a major role in

³² Nasaruddin Umar, The Qur'an in the Eyes of Former Muslim Intellectuals: Ibn Warraq and Mark A. Gabriel, in the journal *of Qur'an Studies*, second edition, 2006, 91-93.

³³ Hayat Hidayat and Moh. Hidayat, *Ibid*, 41.

³⁴ Hayat Hidayat and Moh. Hidayat, *Ibid*., 42.

³⁵ Bisri Musthofa, Noldeke's Attack on the Authenticity of the Qur'an in the journal *el Harakah* Vol. 8, No, 1 January-April 2006, 100.

legitimizing, reconstructing, and summarizing the teachings in previous books before being disseminated to Muslims. However, this is not in line with Noldeke's thoughts, he considers that the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) made these changes because he was in more detail about the data in the Qur'an so that there were many differences with the previous book.³⁶

Meanwhile, the *orientalist* others consider that the Qur'an is a conspiracy of the Prophet Muhammad and consider that Islam is a heresy of the Jews which is only a derivation of previous religious concepts. Nicknames *Ummi* which was named after the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) is often a source of misunderstanding among *orientalist* in judging Islam. after conducting an investigation through Arabic literature, Noldeke assumed that *Ummi* is an antonym of *Ahl Kitab* which has the definition of "blind or not knowing the previous book". This is found in the words of Allah in Surah al-Ankabut verse 48 and Surah Al-A'raf verse 157. Noldeke considers that the nickname *Ummi* Related to *Almaya* or the author of the book who is the object of the revelation of the previous book.³⁷

وَمَا كُنْتُمْ تَتْلُوا مِنْ قَبْلِهِ مِنْ كِتَابٍ وَلَا تَخُطُّهُ بِيَمِينِكُمْ إِذَا لَارْتَابَ الْمُبْطِلُونَ ٤٨

“And you have never read any book before (the Quran), nor have you ever written a book with your own hand; if you had (read and written), those who deny you would surely have doubted.” 48

الَّذِينَ يَتَّبِعُونَ الرَّسُولَ النَّبِيَّ الْأُمِّيَّ الَّذِي يَجِدُونَهُ مَكْنُوزًا عِنْدَهُمْ فِي التَّوْرَةِ وَالْإِنْجِيلِ يَأْمُرُهُمْ بِالْمَعْرُوفِ وَيَنْهَاهُمْ عَنِ الْمُنْكَرِ وَيُجِلُّ لَهُمُ الطَّيِّبَاتِ وَيُحَرِّمُ عَلَيْهِمُ الْخَبَائِثَ وَيَضَعُ عَنْهُمْ إِصْرَهُمْ وَالْأَغْلَالَ الَّتِي كَانَتْ عَلَيْهِمْ فَاَلَّذِينَ ءَامَنُوا بِهِ وَعَزَّرُوهُ وَنَصَرُوهُ وَاتَّبَعُوا النُّورَ الَّذِي أُنْزِلَ مَعَهُ ۙ أُولَٰئِكَ هُمُ الْمُفْلِحُونَ ١٥٧

“(That is) those who follow the Messenger, the unlettered Prophet whose name they find written in the Torah and the Gospel that are with them, who commands them to do what is right and forbids them from doing what is wrong, and permits for them all that is good and prohibits for them all that is evil, and removes from them the burdens and shackles that were upon them. So those who believe in him, honor him, support him, and follow the clear light revealed to him (the Quran)—they are the ones who are successful.” 157

Those who follow the Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) and the Messenger of Allaah (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) said: "The

³⁶ Theodore Noldeke, *The History of The Qur'an*, (Leiden: Brill, 2013), 13.

SABILUNA: Journal of Islamic Studies E-ISSN: 3109-6581

Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) said: "The Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) said: The Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) said: "The Messenger of Allaah (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) said:

In addition, in Surah Al-Waqiah, verse 79:

لَا يَمَسُّهُ إِلَّا الْمُطَهَّرُونَ ٧٩

"No one may touch it except those who have been purified." 79

According to Noldeke, the prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) only mastered Arabic, and from this verse there was a distorted perception by Noldeke. Noldeke considers that there is a mistake of the Prophet Muhammad in the verse, Noldeke considers that the sentence of the verse has been changed by the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) and it means that the Qur'an is not intended for other Muslims³⁸

Noldeke assumes that the revelation obtained by the prophet Muhammad (saw) is the result of Muhammad's instinct, the prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) invites mankind to believe that Islam is only limited to following instinct. And this is likened to the history of the prophets of Israel who received revelation from Yahweh, with Muhammad's ignorance of the meaning of good or bad. Because according to Noldeke, something that is done without being based on desires is a bad thing in this case Noldeke considers it as the apostolic gift of Muhammad.³⁹

There are several other assumptions from Noldeke, that Islam has similarities with Judaism and Christianity in theological aspects, *First*, Problems with sentences There is no .God but Allah, if in Islam Muslims have an absolute obligation to believe it. The sentence is likened to the theology in Judaism and Christianity found in Samuel (32-22) and Psalm (18:32). *Second*, Nickname *Ummy* Noldeke considered that at the age of 40 when the Prophet Muhammad received the revelation, he was already in a good state of writing, because the people of Mecca were considered to be good at writing.⁴⁰

Conclusion

³⁷ .,Ibid, 11

³⁸ Theodor Noldeke, et al., *The History of The Qur'an*, edited and translated by Wolfgang H. Behn from the original title "Geschichte des Qorans" Leiden-Boston : Brill, 2013, 5

³⁹ .,Ibid, 2.

⁴⁰ Muhammad Faruq an Nabhani, *al-Madkha 'ila 'Ulumi Al-Qur'an*, Cet.ke 1 (Halb : Dar 'Alim al-Qur'an, 2005),42.

The emergence of orientalism shows that the Qur'an as a miracle revealed to the prophet Muhammad (saw) which is intended as a guideline for mankind is a miracle that is so extraordinary that it can attract the attention of various circles outside of Muslims. Of course, this phenomenon is a great challenge for Muslim intellectuals in defending the truths in Islam, especially in the Qur'an. This is not enough if studied through one scientific field alone, of course it requires many points of view to be able to be convinced of the truth of the Qur'an. And to fight the thought *orientalist* Westernism is present to balance Western thinking towards the East and to map the representation of the Western world as dominance in the world.

References

- Badawi, Abdurrahman, *Ensiklopedi Tokoh Orientalis*, Yogyakarta : LKiS.2003.
- Badruzzaman,Abad, *Kiri Islam Hasan Hanafi : Menggugat Kemapanan Agama dan Politik*, Yogyakarta:Tiara Wacana. 2005
- Bell, Richard & W.M.Watt, *Introduction to the Qur'an*, Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press. ,1970
- Daya,Burhanuddin,*Pergumulan Timur Menyikapi Barat : Dasar-Dasar Oksidentalisme*,t.t:Suka Press. 2008
- Esposito, John I., *The Oxford Encyclopedea of The Modern Islamic Word*, New York : Oxford University Press. 1995
- Fadal,Kurid, *Pandangan Orientalis Terhadap Al-Qur'an : Teori Pengaruh Al-Qur'an Theodor Noldeke dalam jurnal Religia : Jurusan Ushuludin STAIN Pekalongan*, Vol, 14, No, 2 Oktober. 2011
- Firdaus, Muhammad Yoga, ,“Diskursus Al-Qur'an dan Prosesi Pewahyuan dalam jurnal *Madani : Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Keislaman* 12, No. 1. 2022
- Hakim, Abdurrahman, , “*Tafsir Al-Qur'an Dengan Al-Qur'an: Studi Analisis-Kritis dalam Lintas Sejarah*,” *Misykat* 2, no. 1. 2017
- Hanafi, Hasan, *Dari Akidah ke Revolusi Sikap Kita Terhadap Tradisi Lama*, Jakarta: Paramadina. ,2003
- Hanafi, Hasan, *Muqaddimah fi 'ilm al-istighrah*,Kairo: Al Dar al Faniyah, Cet. 1.
- Hanafi, Hassan, *Oksidentalisme*, Jakarta: Paramadina, 2000
- Hanafi,Hasan, *Oksidentalisme Sikap Kita Terhadap Tradisi Barat*, Jakarta: Paramadina. ,2000

- Hanafi, Hasan, *The Relevance of The Islamic Alternative in Egypt*, Arab Study Quarterly, 1982
- Hidayat, Hayat dan Mohammad Hidayat, *Sejarah al-Qur'an dalam Pandangan Theodor Noldeke (1836-1930)* dalam “*Kajian Orientalis Terhadap al-Qur'an dan Hadis*” Editor M. Anwar Syarifuddin, Jakarta: UIN Sayirf Hidayatullah. ,2012
- Jeffery, Arthur, *Progress in the Study of the Qur'an Text*, tt. Muslim World, 1935.
- Kritzeck, James, *Sons of Abraham : Jews, Christianity and Moslems*, Baltimore : Gelicon Press. , 1962
- Musthofa, Bisri, Serangan Noldeka Terhadap Autentisitas Al-Qur'an dalam jurnal *el Harakah* Vol. 8, No, 1 Januari-April 2006.
- Nabhani, Muhammad Faruq an, *al-Madkha 'ila 'Ulumi Al-Qur'an*, Cet.ke 1, Halb : Dar 'Alim al-Qur'an. , 2005
- Noldeke, Theodore, *The History of The Qur'an*, Leiden: Brill, 2013.
- Peters, *Childern of Abraham : Judaism, Christianity, Islam*, Princeton: Princeton University Press. , 1984
- Rahman, Nur Fuadi, “Hermeneutika Al-Qur'an,” dalam Jurnal *Transformatif (Islamic Studies)* 1, no. 2. 2017
- Rihlasyita, Wilda, Kiri Islam Hasan Hanafi Dan Oksidentalisme dalam jurnal *Al Yasini* Vol. 04, Nomor 02, November. ,2019
- Riyani, Irma, “Menelusuri Latar Historis Turunnya al-Quran dan Proses Pembentukan Tatanan Masyarakat,” dalam jurnal *Al-Bayan: Jurnal Studi Al-Qur'an dan Tafsir*, Vol. 1, no. 1. ,2016
- Saeed, Abdullah, *The Quran: An Introduction*, London dan New York: Routledge, 2008
- Said, Edward W, *Orientalisme*, Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar., 2016
- Sholihah, Kajian Hadits Perspektif Orientalis dalam jurnal *Samasyat : Jurnal Studi Islam dan Sosial* Vol. 6 No. 1, 2022
- Umar, Nasaruddin, *Al-Qur'an di Mata Mantan Intelektual Muslim : Ibn Warraq dan Mark A. Gabriel*, dalam jurnal *Studi Al-Qur'an*, edisi kedua. ,2006